

**THIS LETTER HAS BEEN TRANSLATED FROM HEBREW**

February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2012

To:

Professor Yaakov Neeman, Minister of Justice

[sar@justice.gov.il](mailto:sar@justice.gov.il)

**To the Ministry of Justice:**

**Re: The Praver plan accepted by the government stands in contradiction to the recommendations of the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and implementation of the recommendations of the committee on policy and government operations**

On 11 September 2011, the government authorized a plan called the Praver-Amidoror Report, which stands in contradiction to the recommendations of the United Nations Human Rights Committee upon its consideration of the State's implementation of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights in July 2010. According to the plan, 30,000 Bedouin residents will be moved from their villages to towns and many villages will be destroyed. However, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) issued the following concluding observations, among others, on 2 December 2011:

27. The committee is concerned that the plan for planning Bedouin settlement and economic development of the Bedouin population in the Negev, based on the recommendations of the Goldberg Committee, approved in September 2011, predicts an outline of a plan that will be carried out within a short and limited time period, including an enforcement mechanism for implementing the laws of planning and construction (clause 1).

**The committee recommends that the State of Israel guarantee that implementation of the plan not cause forceful evacuation of Bedouins. The committee recommends that any evacuation be based on freely given agreement and advance notice, and that the people who are moved will receive appropriate compensation in accordance with general comment number 7 of the committee (1997) on the topic of the right to appropriate housing: forced evacuation. The committee also recommends that the State of Israel formally resolve the question of the unrecognized villages, cease destruction of houses in these villages, and guarantee the right to appropriate housing.**

37. The committee is concerned that the means which the State of Israel is using to move the location of the Bedouin villages to new settlements will negatively interfere with their cultural rights and their connection with their traditional ancestral land. **The committee recommends that the State of Israel completely respect the rights of the Bedouin Arabs to their ancient and traditional lands.**

The Praver Amidror Plan does not meet the international standards as determined by the CESCR in December 2011. We expect you to actualize the recommendations of the United Nations committee, draw the attention of those connected to this matter to these recommendations and dissuade the government of Israel from implementing this plan.

In addition, we would like to clarify whether the material is translated and available to a broad audience, and to authorities and administrations, both legal and judicial. These documents must be available to civil society and to the non-governmental organizations working in Israel. In addition to Hebrew, the documents must also be translated into Arabic.

We submit to you the following questions:

1. When does your office intend to translate these materials and give the public access to them?
2. When does the Ministry of Justice intend to prepare itself in order to actualize the concluding observations of the CESCR?
3. Does your office have a mechanism for implementing the concluding observations?
4. When does our office intend to relate to these concluding observations?
5. Is it your intention to? If so, when will you instruct government ministries and relevant authorities to learn about the meaning of the recommendations and to actualize them?

As an organization for human rights advocating civil equality, it is critically important to us that the various government offices in Israel ensure the conclusions are put into effect and act according to them.

Sincerely,

The Secretariat of the Negev Coexistence Forum for Civil Equality  
Avner Ben-Amos, Khalil Alamour, Yaacov Manor, Musa Abu-Ghanem, S'aid a-Sana,  
Rodaina Abu-Freiha, Rachel Naparstek

Copies:

The United Nations Human Rights Council (English translation only)  
The Popular Committee for Recognition Now  
The Committee for Guidance of Arabs in the Negev  
Association of Civil Rights in Israel  
The Tarabut-Hithabrut Movement  
Adallah – the Center for Justice of the Arab Minority in Israel  
Bimkom – Planners for Planning Rights

Organizations of the Recognition Forum:

The Association of Forty – for the Recognition of the Unrecognized Arab Villages,  
Gush Shalom,

The Association for the Assistance and Protection of Bedouin Rights in Israel,  
Social Television,

The Center for Alternative Information,

Yesh Gvul,

The Israeli Committee Against House Demolition

New Profile,

Women's Coalition for Peace

Rabbis for Human Rights,

Ta' Ayush – Arab Jewish Partnership